

Education and Welfare in the 21st Century

Jane Gingrich
University of Oxford



Objectives

The purpose of this course is to analyze the intersection among education systems, the welfare state, and the broader political economy, asking three interrelated sets of questions intersection.

First, what is the relationship between the development of mass education systems and broader systems of social protection and economic organization? Over the past two decades, scholars examining the origins of advanced welfare states and their relationship to the broader political economy have conceptualized the nature of social protection in starkly different terms, leading to varying explanatory logics emphasizing redistributive versus insurance demands (which in turn build on longer standing debates examining the relative influence of organized class-based struggles versus cross-class coordination in explaining welfare formation). More recent work applies this logic to the development and expansion of mass educational systems, examining education systems' redistributive potential and varied role in skill formation across different 'growth models'. Do these approaches provide us with insights for understanding the varied processes of educational expansion that historically involved a broader set of non-economic actors (e.g. Churches, local governments, international actors), aims (e.g. building and staffing a professional civil service, shaping national culture), and policy structures. How far do 'workhouse' political economy models take us in conceptualizing education systems? What can the study of education teach us about social policy?

Second, what characterizes the politics of educational expansion and reform in a post-industrial democracy? One of the defining features of post-industrial economic structures is the changing demand for skills (and occupations employing different types of skills) – indeed, scholars often use the 'knowledge economy' interchangeably with post-industrialism in defining the contemporary environment. These shifts have both fed into new demands for educational expansion and changing political coalitions around the traditional social policies. The relationship between these two shifts, however, is matter of debate in political science. Is educational expansion a functional equivalent to redistributive policies in a post-industrial economy? Why have some countries devoted more resources and attention to educational expansion in recent years than others? Do the politics of structural reform in education (marketization, increased centralization of testing and so on) follow the same path?

Finally, the last session investigates the role of education in reshaping social demands. Education is increasingly a new social cleavage, with highly educated voters expressing more socially liberal (but often more economically conservative) values. While much of the debate about the expansion of education on changing political coalitions looks at education as a marker of new class structures, in this final section we further examine the experience of education itself. What about education is shaping this new cleavage? Do the effects of education largely operate through changed labor market opportunities and occupational socialization or does how citizens are educated – or with whom they are educated - matter?

Note: While the focus is largely on advanced industrial democracies, a broader set of literature is referenced in the recommended.

Course requirements.

All participants should read the * readings. The other core readings are discretionary, but useful. The additional readings are for information, and refer to the readings that will be discussed in the lectures.

All participants should write two brief memos over the three day period (2-4 pages) each based on one set sessions (i.e. 1a/b 2a/b etc). The memo should respond to the set questions for the session, but can be more narrow in focus. The purpose of the memos is to stimulate discussion, and they should be circulated prior to the discussion. **To be shared by uploading to the folder in course Drive at least evening before discussion.**

Day 1: The origins of mass education systems

The morning session examines three basic frameworks for conceptualizing social policy and its expansion in advanced democracies: those conceptualizing the welfare state as a relatively undifferentiated product of economic modernization and democratic demands, those conceptualizing it as a redistributive policy emerging from political class struggles, and those conceptualizing it as insurance supporting different forms of skill formation across varying economic systems. All three perspectives have implications for how we understand educational expansion and the conditions under which it is likely to occur.

The afternoon sessions examines the historical origins of mass education systems. In this session, we ask whether social policy approaches conceptualizing education as part of a democratic or economic logic (either productive or redistributive) have a strong empirical foundation relative to those emphasizing its distinct dynamics as part of broader processes of cultural reproduction, values, and identity formation.

Session 1: The Expansion of Mass Systems of Social Protection

Lecture 1a - What do welfare states do? How do they vary? Why?

- Underlying conceptualization of social programs - redistribution versus risk
- Classic theories of welfare state variation - Power resource approaches and Employer Centred approaches
- Classic theories of welfare state variation – Electoral demand for welfare

Lecture 1b – What does the welfare state teach us about education?

- Role of education in classic theories?
- Applying redistributive/conflict models and insurance/coordination models to educational development

Recommended Readings (Review if unfamiliar)

- Gosta Esping-Andersen. 1990. *Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism*. Princeton University Press. Chapter 1-2, p. 9-54 (54 pages)
 - As background, you may also be interested in Jane Gingrich. 2015. “Coalitions, policies, and distribution: Esping-Andersen’s three worlds of welfare capitalism” in James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen. *Advances in Comparative Historical Analysis*. Cambridge University Press. P. 58-87.
- Isabella Mares. 2001 “Firms and the Welfare State: When, Why and How Does Social Policy Matter to Employers?” in *Varieties of Capitalism*. Hall and Soskice. Chapter 5, p. 184-212. (26 pages)
- Iversen and Soskice. 2001. "An Asset Theory of Social Policy Preferences." *American Political Science Review*. Volume 95, Issue 4 December 2001 , pp. 875-893.

Session 2: The Expansion of Mass Education Systems

Lecture 2a - What core features the early movement towards mass education?

- Education and state formation
- Timing, character, and emphasis
- Education systems in the post-war period

Lecture 2b - Can we understand educational expansion in terms of redistributive demands? Did the demand for specific types of skills drive early expansion

- Contribution of the political economy approach
- Limits of the political economy approach

Core Readings

- ***Ben Ansell and Johannes Lindvall. "The political origins of primary education systems: Ideology, institutions, and interdenominational conflict in an era of nation-building." *American Political Science Review*. 107(3): 505-522.**
- Marius Busemeyer. 2015. *Skills and Inequality*. Oxford University Press. Chapter 1.
- ***Thomas Gift and Erik Wibbels. 2014. "Reading, Writing, and the Regrettable Status of Education Research in Comparative Politics." *Annual Review of Political Science*. Vol. 17. 291-312**
- Gilles Saint-Paul and Thierry Verdier. 1993. "Education, democracy and growth". *Journal of Development Economics*. 42(2):399-407.
- ***Andy Green. 1992. *Education and State Formation: The Rise of Education Systems in England, France and the USA*. Palgrave. Chapter 1**
- John W Meyer, Francisco O Ramirez, Yasemin Soysal. 1992. World expansion of mass education, 1870-1980. *Sociology of education*. 65(2): 128-149.

Additional Resources: Note this is a **selective** (not comprehensive) sampling of literature from a variety of different perspectives on the early expansion of mass education systems, and their role and function in the polity and economy.

- Jutta Allmedingar. 1989. "Educational systems and labor market outcomes". *European sociological review*. 5(1): 231-250.
 - Classic conceptualization of the early variation in systems, developing a conceptual framework built around the degree of stratification and standardization in education.
- Ben Ansell. 2010. *From the ballot to the blackboard: The redistributive political economy of education*. Cambridge University Press.
 - Applies a redistributive political economy lens, which conceptualizes differential gains across the income spectrum, to educational enrolment expansion and spending.
- Gary S Becker. 2009 . *Human capital: A theoretical and empirical analysis, with special reference to education*. University of Chicago Press.
 - Gary Becker's classic analysis, which forms an important intellectual core to skill based theories of welfare and growth models.
- Aaron Benavot and Julia Resnik. 2007. "Lessons from the Past: A Comparative Socio-Historical Analysis of Primary and Secondary Education." In *Educating All Children A Global Agenda*. Editors: Joel E. Cohen and David E. Bloom and Martin B. Malin, pp.123-23. The MIT Press, pp. 123-230.
 - A succinct review of a wide range of literature in sociology, development economic, and historical analysis of the origins of mass education systems, including literature focused on colonial institutions and educational expansion in developing countries.

- Samuel Bowles and Herbert Gintis. *Schooling in capitalist America: Educational reform and the contradictions of economic life*.
 - Classic Marxist interpretation of the role of education in social reproduction.
- Keith Darden and Harris Mylonas. 2015 “Threats to Territorial Integrity, National Mass Schooling, and Linguistic Commonality.” *Comparative Political Studies*. 49 issue: 11, page(s): 1446-1479
 - An historical analysis of the links between territorial conflict and investment in educational structures in the state building period, and contemporary linguistic homogeneity.
- Torben Iversen and John Stephens. 2008. Partisan politics, the welfare state, and three worlds of human capital formation. *Comparative Political Studies*. Volume: 41 issue: 4-5, page(s): 600-637.
 - A theoretical argument bridging both power-resource and Varieties of Capitalism perspectives on welfare state formation with the role of human capital across European welfare states.
- Lindert, Peter. 2004. *Growing Public: Social Spending and Economic Growth since the Eighteenth Century*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
 - Quantitative historical analysis of the determinants of public spending and educational expansion.
- Kimberly Morgan. 2006. *Working mothers and the welfare state: Religion and the politics of work-family policies in Western Europe and the United States*. Stanford University Press.
 - An historical analysis of early expansion of benefits for mothers – including early childhood education – in Europe and the US, emphasizing the explanatory role of religion.
- Kathleen Thelen. 2004 . *How institutions evolve: The political economy of skills in Germany, Britain, the United States, and Japan*
 - Thelen’s classic work on the development and change in institutions of training and vocational training across industrial economies.

Day 2: Post-industrial welfare state and education

We first examine the changing perspectives in the field of labor economics and sociology towards skills, inequality and growth. We look at the literature in the United States and Europe focusing on structural changes in demand for skills and the link (or lack thereof) to rising income inequality and changes in the class structure. We then turn to the political science literature on the implications of the changing occupational structure, changing geographic structure, and new welfare and education policy cleavages emerging around education.

In the afternoon session, we turn to the politics of expanding education itself, tracing the ‘social investment’ agenda as part of a general shift to conflict on the ‘supply side’ of the economy. In this section, we ask why social investment has met with varied support, politically and economically, despite the seeming support of voters and policymakers alike for more investments in skills.

Session 3: The Rise of the Knowledge Economy

Lecture 3a – Post-industrial transitions

- Defining post-industrial shifts
- Skill biased technological changed, job polarization, the rise of superstar firms
- Social, economic and geographic consequences of changes in the skills structure

Lecture 3b – What are the implications of educational upgrading for the political coalitions around social policy?

- Changes in the class structure – dealignment and realignment
- Education as a new social cleavage
- Educational investment as a new attitudinal divide

Core Reading (skim the first two readings)

- Claudia Goldin and Lawrence F Katz. *The race between education and technology*. Harvard University Press, 2009. Chapter 1.
- Maarten Goos and Alan Manning. 2009. Job polarization in Europe. *American economic review*, 99(2). 58-63
- Daniel Oesch. 2013. *Occupational change in Europe: How technology and education transform the job structure*. Oxford University Press, 2013. Chapter 1.
- ***Pablo Beramendi, Silja Häusermann, Herbert Kitschelt, and Hanspeter Kriesi. 2015. *The Politics of Advanced Capitalism*. Cambridge University Press. Introduction* and chapter by Ben Ansell and Jane Gingrich on ‘Social Investment’.**
- Jane Gingrich and Silja Häusermann. "The decline of the working- class vote, the reconfiguration of the welfare support coalition and consequences for the welfare state." *Journal of European Social Policy*. 25(1):50-75, 2015

Additional Resources: Post-Industrial Structures, Occupational Change, and New Political Actors

- David Autor, David Dorn, Lawrence F. Katz, Christina Patterson, John Van Reenen. 2017. The Fall of the Labor Share and the Rise of Superstar Firms. *CEPR Discussion Paper No. DP12041*.
 - Important recent work on market concentration and the changing behaviors of firms, which has implications for the education debate. This popular article reflecting on Thomas Piketty’s contribution is also of interest.
 - <http://bostonreview.net/class-inequality/marshall-steinbaum-why-are-economists-giving-piketty-cold-shoulder>
- Lucio Baccaro and Jonas Pontusson. “Rethinking comparative political economy the growth model perspective.” *Politics & Society*: 44(2):175– 207, 2016
 - Recent work on the politics of nationally variable ‘growth models’ which build on different uses of human capital.
- Herbert Kitschelt and Philipp Rehm. “Occupations as a site of political preference formation.” *Comparative Political Studies*. 47(12):1670– 1706, 2014.
 - Building on some of Kitschelt’s earlier work on occupational socialization and Rehm’s work on risk structures, this paper examining how changing occupational structures feed into different dimensions of political attitudes.
- Torben Iversen and David Soskice. 2015. “Democratic limits to redistribution: inclusionary versus exclusionary coalitions in the knowledge economy.” *World Politics*. 67(2): 185-225.
 - Work by Iversen and Soskice on conceptualizing the underlying shifts in the coalition structure between high and low skilled workers in the face of de-industrialization. Forms part of a research agenda leading to a new book length treatment of the topic.
- David Rueda. "Insider-outsider politics in industrialized democracies: the challenge to social democratic parties." *American Political Science Review*. 99(01):61-74, 2005.

- While not focused on education, Rueda's important work on insider-outsider dynamics, particularly for parties on the left, has crucial implications for the politics of strategies that move away from social consumption approaches.
- Kathleen Thelen. 2014. *Varieties of liberalization and the new politics of social solidarity*. Cambridge University Press. Chapter 1.
 - An account for the changed nature of the coalitions around production (including skill formation) and distribution have drifted apart in some contexts.
- Anne Wren. 2013. *The political economy of the service transition*. Oxford University Press. Chapter 1.
 - Provides an overview of how structural changes associated with the rise of the service sector have altered the underlying models of advanced political economies

Session 4: Electoral and Distributive politics of Social Investment

Lecture 4a – What is social investment?

- What is social investment?
- Expansion of higher education
- Voters and the politics of social investment

Lecture 4b - Do the politics of education reform differ in systems with strong and weak teachers' unions?

- Interest groups in education
- New actors – philanthropists, private firms, and non-state actors

Core Readings:

- ***Carles Boix. *Political parties, growth and equality: Conservative and social democratic economic strategies in the world economy*. Cambridge University Press, 1998. Chapter 1.**
- Natalie Morel, Bruno Palier and Joakim Palme. 2011. *Towards a social investment welfare state?: Ideas, policies and challenges*. Policy Press. Chapter 1
- ***Marius Busemeyer, Julian Garritzmann and Eric Neimanns. 2018. "Public demand for social investment: new supporting coalitions for welfare state reform in Western Europe?" *Journal of European Social Policy*. 844-861.**
- Terry Moe and Susan Wiborg. 2015. *The Comparative Politics of Education*. Cambridge University Press. Chapter 1.

Additional Reading

- Ben Ansell. 2008. "University Challenges: Explaining Institutional Change in Higher Education". *World Politics*. 60(2): 189-230.
 - A theoretical analysis of the redistributive political dynamics of extending higher education.
- Marius Busemeyer. 2007. "Determinants of public education spending in 21 OECD democracies, 1980-2001". *Journal of European Public Policy*. 582-610.
 - An analysis of the demography and structural determinants of education spending.
- Marius R. Busemeyer, Achim Goerres, and Simon Weschle. 2009: "Attitudes towards Redistributive Spending in an Era of Demographic Ageing: The Rival

- Pressures from Age and Income in 14 OECD Countries.” *Journal of European Social Policy* 19/3: 195-212.
- An examination of age and education effects in shaping public attitudes.
 - Niccolo Durazzi. 2018. “The political economy of high skills: higher education in knowledge-based labour markets”. *Journal of European Public Policy*.
 - A theorization of different systems of higher education and skill production in the contemporary era.
 - Carsten Jensen. 2011. “Capitalist systems, deindustrialization, and the politics of public education”. *Comparative Political Studies*. 44(4): 412-435.
 - An analysis of the demography and structural determinants of education spending.
 - Julian Garritzmann. 2015. “Attitudes towards student support: How positive feedback-effects prevent change in the Four Worlds of Student Finance”. *Journal of European Social Policy*. 25: 2, 139-158.
 - An analysis of different ‘worlds’ of
 - Silja Hausermann, Thomas Kurer, Hanna Schwander. 2015. “High-skilled outsiders? Labor market vulnerability, education and welfare state preferences.” *Socio-Economic Review*. 13(2): 235-258.
 - An examination of the attitudes of higher-skilled labor market outsiders, an increasingly important economic and political group.
 - Anton Hemerijk. 2012. *Changing welfare states*. Oxford University Press. Chapter 1. P. 1-23.
 - A comprehensive review of social investment policies in the framework of broader welfare reform across Europe.
 - Agustina Paglayan. 2018. “Public-Sector Unions and the Size of Government.” *American Journal of Political Science*.
 - Empirically examines the claims in that public sector unions inflate budget size through a careful study of US states.
 - Sarah Reckhow. *Follow the money: How foundation dollars change public school politics*. Oxford University Press. Chapter 1
 - An analysis of the growth of private philanthropy in American education.
 - Wolfgang Streeck and Daniel Mertens. Public finance and the decline of state capacity in democratic capitalism. In Wolfgang Streeck and Armin Schäffer, editors, *Politics in the Age of Austerity*, pages 25–58. Polity Press, 2013.
 - A provocative piece, arguing that investment suffers under periods of austerity in ways that often do not recover.

Day 3: Education Reform and Downstream Consequences

We start by continuing the discussion of educational reform. We turn to two areas of increasing importance – structural reforms in the organization of educational systems and attention to educational equality. Over the past decade, many countries have engaged in a mix of seemingly contradictory reforms, both expanding school autonomy and competition and increasing central control over inspection, curriculum and testing. More recently, the question of equity (a perennial concern in education politics) has re-emerged in new ways, as the link between trends in the labor market, parental sorting, migration, and marketizing reforms have raised questions about the nature of equal education in contemporary politics. This lecture looks at the varied attention to these issues, and choices of reform paths. We then turn to examining the question of equality of opportunity from another angle, focusing on youth inclusion. Here we look at the regulatory-welfare-education nexus around youth inclusion, asking what factors shape varying school-to-work transitions among young people.

In the final session we return to questions we first encountered the previous – the changing nature of political cleavages. Here, however, we revisit the question of downstream effects of

changing structures of education from the perspective of educational experiences rather than class dynamics. We ask whether education itself exerts long-run effects on citizen attitudes.

Session 5: Quality and Equality in Education

Lecture 5a- Why has educational quality emerged as a major issue?

- NPM agenda
- More autonomy more rules?
- Educational inclusion in an era of growing inequality

Lecture 5b – Why do young people with high and low skills fare differently across places?

- Welfare-Training nexus for young people
- What explains variation?
- Youth as a political force

Core Reading

- John Chubb and Terry Moe. 1990. *Politics, markets, and America's schools*. Brookings Institution. Chapter 1.
- ***Christoffer Green Pedersen. 2018. *The Reshaping of West European Party Politics. Chapter 10 “Attention to education in the post-industrial society”.* Oxford University Press.**
- ***Marius Busemeyer. 2015. *Skills and Inequality. Chapter 4.***
- Miles Corak. 2013. "Income Inequality, Equality of Opportunity, and Intergenerational Mobility." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*. 27(3): 79-102.
- Ben Ansell and Jane Gingrich. 2018. "Skills in Demand? Higher Education and Social Investment in Europe." In *Welfare Democracies and Party Politics*. Eds. Philip Manow, Bruno Palier, Hanna Schwander. Oxford University Press.
- Tom Chevalier. 2016. "Varieties of youth welfare citizenship: Towards a two-dimension typology." *Journal of European Social Policy*. 26:1, 3-19.
- Richard Breen. 2005. Explaining Cross-national Variation in Youth Unemployment: Market and Institutional Factors. *European Sociological Review*, Volume 21, Issue 2, 1 April 2005, Pages 125–134.

Additional Reading on Education Reform

- Stephen Ball. 2017. *The education debate*. Policy Press. Chapter 1.
 - A theoretically grounded analysis of education reform in the UK and beyond.
- Jane Gingrich. 2011. *Making Markets in the Welfare State*. Cambridge University Press. Chapter 5 on education.
 - An analysis of varying forms of marketization in primary and secondary education.
- Hirschman, Albert O. 1970. *Exit, Voice, and Loyalty: Responses to Decline in Firms, Organizations, and States*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press. Chapter 1.
 - Classic argument about alternative modes of creating responsiveness within organizations.
- Michael Klitgaard. 2008. "School vouchers and the new politics of the welfare state." *Governance*. 21(4): 479-498.

- An analysis of politics of choice based reforms in Europe.
- Henry Levin. 2001. *Privatizing Education: Can The School Marketplace Deliver Freedom Of Choice, Efficiency, Equity, And Social Cohesion?* Perseus
- Le Grand, J. 2007. *The other invisible hand: Delivering public services through choice and competition*, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
 - An argument for using different models of public sector management.

Session 6: Education, Education Policies, and Individual Attitudes

- **Lecture 6a and 6b:** – Does education have a direct effect on attitudes or behaviors?

Core Reading

- Suzanne Mettler and Eric Welch. 2004. “Civic Generation: Policy Feedback Effects of the GI Bill on Political Involvement over the Life Course” *British Journal of Political Science.* 34: 497-518.
- ***Charlotte Cavaille and John Marshall. 2019. Education and anti-immigration attitudes: Evidence from compulsory schooling reforms across Western Europe. *American Political Science Review.* 113(1): 254-263.**
- ***Karl-Oskar Lindgren, Sven Oskarsson and Christopher T. Dawes. “Can Political Inequalities Be Educated Away? Evidence from a Large-Scale Reform. *American Journal of Political Science.* 61(1): 222-236.**

Additional Reading

- Sarah Bruch and Joe Soss. 2018. “Schooling as a formative political experience: Authority relations and the education of citizens.” *Perspectives of Politics.* 16(1): 36-57.
 - An interesting case of the long-run effects of punitive treatment in schools on political participation.
- Andrea Campbell. 2012. “Policy Makes Mass Politics.” *Annual Review of Political Science.* 15: 333-351.
 - An overview of the literature on mass feedbacks from policy.
- Russell Dalton. 2007. Partisan mobilization, cognitive mobilization and the changing American electorate. *Electoral Studies.*
 - A revisiting of Dalton’s classic argument about cognitive mobilization in the US case.
- Adam Berinsky and Gabriel Lenz. 2011. “Education and political participation: Exploring the causal link.” *Political Behavior.* 33(3): 357-73.
 - An examination of literature on the causal effect of education on participation.
- Tali Mendelberg, Katherine T. McCabe, and Adam Thal. 2017. “College Socialization and the Economic Views of Affluent Americans.” *American Journal of Political Science.* 61 (3): 606-623.
 - An examination of the effects of the social aspects of college education on economic conservatism.
- Paula Surridge. 2016. Education and liberalism: pursuing the link. *Oxford Review of Education.* 42(2): 146-164.
 - An examination of the effects of college education on cultural liberalism.
- John Marshall. 2016. "Education and Voting Conservative: Evidence from a Major Schooling Reform in Great Britain. *Journal of Politics* 78 (2), 382-395 or “The Anti Democrat Diploma: How High School Education Decreases Support for the Democratic Party”. *American Journal of Political Science.*

- Two studies examining the effects of expanding compulsory schooling on long-run economic conservatism.